

Crusading and the Penitential Life: James of Vitry's Crusade Sermon Models and Llull's *De fine*

Pamela Beattie

University of Louisville, Kentucky

pamela.beattie@louisville.edu

The precise nature of Llull's relationship to his contemporary intellectual and cultural milieu is notoriously difficult to ascertain due to the *sui generis* nature of his literary output, his *Art*, his reluctance to cite authorities, and, however he chose to present it in the autobiographical bits of his texts and the semi-autobiographical *Vita coetanea*, his persistent—indeed, almost stubborn—unwillingness to commit fully to any religious group or institution.¹ His mid-life conversion to a life of penitence meant that he brought to the consideration of any topic the sensibilities of his social order, the educated laity of the thirteenth century, together with the distinctive religious concerns of that group. His initial intellectual and religious formation was that of the group which Pope Innocent III and others envisioned as the audience for the measures of pastoral education and reform articulated at the Fourth Lateran Council. Llull's subsequent, or

Rebut el 4 de juny de 2014. Acceptat el 2 d'agost de 2014. doi: 10.3306/STUDIALULLIANA.109.33 Pamela Beattie. ISSN: 2340-4752.

¹ For Llull's literary *persona* see L. Badia, "Ramon Llull: Autor i Personatge", in *Aristotelica et Lulliana magistro doctissimo Charles H. Lohr septuagesimum annum feliciter agentii dedicata*, F. Domínguez, R. Imbach, T. Pindl and P. Walter (eds.), *Instrumenta Patristica XXVI* (Steenbrughe / The Hague, Abbatia Sancti Petri: Martinus Nijhoff International, 1995), pp. 355-375. Llull likes to present himself as somewhat of a fool—marginalized and on the fringes—but the careful reader of his work should not be "fooled" by this move; it is part of a much more sophisticated literary strategy than has often been recognized.

post-conversion, formation was unusual; it was rooted first in the monastic education and texts available at the monastery of La Real in Majorca and subsequently in the mendicant convents he is known to have visited in the course of his journeys and in the university communities of Montpellier and Paris.² This helps to explain what some have identified as the vaguely “old-fashioned” or twelfth-century quality of Llull’s thought. On the other hand, these were the same texts on which the mendicants relied in order to address their particular audience, which would have been comprised of people from Llull’s social and cultural milieu. That Llull’s life and works reflect this religious culture testifies more to the continuity and persistence of these ideas in the religious culture of the late thirteenth century than it does to any notion that Llull was out of step with his times.³ However, Llull’s formation and his own educational goals were also shaped by his particular desire to write the best book ever against the errors of the unbelievers, which led him to study with an Arabic slave, to withdraw to a hermitage to engage in contemplation, and to develop his *Art*.⁴ Finally, Llull’s writings regularly cross identifiable medieval genres. In sum, Llull and his works stubbornly resist being pigeonholed. While this contributes to the complexity of teasing out the threads of specific intellectual or spiritual influences, it also means that Llull and his ideas can be considered representative of aspects of late thirteenth and early fourteenth-century religiosity. Indeed, it is possible to use Llull as a sort of case-study for the reception of specific religious ideas during this period. A study of this kind can avoid the naive attributions of gener-

² For an inventory of the monastic library and a study of the books that may have been accessibly to Llull in Majorca see, J. N. Hillgarth, *Readers and Books in Majorca 1229-1550*, 2 vols. (Paris: Éditions du CNRS, 1991). Still essential for understanding Llull’s historical and cultural milieu is *idem*, *Ramon Lull and Lullism in Fourteenth-Century France* (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1971), updated in the Catalan translation, *Ramon Llull i el Naixement del Lul·lisme* (Abadia de Montserrat: Curial Edicions Catalanes, 1998).

³ For reevaluation of the nature of mendicant education in this period see, among others, M. Mulchahay, “*First the Bow is Bent in Study*”: *Dominican Education before 1350* (Toronto: Pontifical Institute of Mediaeval Studies Press, 1998); B. Roest, “Franciscan educational perspectives: reworking monastic traditions”, in G. Ferzoco and C. Muessig (ed.) *Medieval Monastic Education* (London / New York: Leicester University Press, 2000), pp. 168-181; *idem*, *Franciscan Literature of Religious Instruction before the Council of Trent* (Leiden: 2004); and *idem*, “The Franciscan School system: Re-assessing the Early Evidence (ca. 1220-1260)”, in *Franciscan Organisation in the Mendicant Context: Formal and Informal Structures of the Friars’ Lives and Ministry in the Middle Ages*, M. Robson and J. Röhrkasten (eds.) (Berlin: LIT Verlag Münster, 2010), pp. 253-79.

⁴ See *Vita coetanea* I.5-III.17, in A. Bonner, *Ramon Llull. A Contemporary Life* (Barcelona / Woodbridge: Barcino / Tamesis, 2010), pp. 33-45. Bonner’s facing-page English translation is based on the critical edition by H. Harada (ed.), *Vita coetanea*, ROL VIII (Turnhout: Brepols, 1980), pp. 271-309. References to the *Vita* will be to Bonner’s text.

alized “influence,” and instead move towards identifying affinities and shared intellectual and religious concerns.⁵

One place in which it is possible to recognize the links between the various elements of Llull’s formation and the development of his own ideas is in the texts where he promotes crusading. The burgeoning scholarship on medieval preaching, sermons, and *pastoralia* has amply shown that preaching was a primary mechanism through which religious instruction was conveyed to the educated laity. In particular, studies of crusade preaching and sermon models have explored the relationship between crusade ideology and other religious ideas and practices.⁶ However, our sources have limitations and many questions about the audience and reception of crusade preaching, the specific content of crusade sermons as preached, and the continuing vibrancy and influence of crusade ideology during Llull’s lifetime remain unanswered.⁷ One modest step towards answering those questions can be taken by comparing *De fine*, the most detailed of Llull’s crusading treatises, with a range of crusade sermon models. The exhortatory tone of Llull’s works addressing the crusades is striking. Their emotional appeal and the language in which specific proposals are couched are more typical of crusade sermons than they are of other types of crusade propaganda characteristic of Llull’s era. This similarity raises questions about what type of intellectual relationship might exist between Llull’s crusade ideology and that

⁵ An excellent example of this type of sound scholarship can be found in H. Hames, *The Art of Conversion: Christianity and Kabbalah in the Thirteenth Century* (Leiden: Brill, 2000) and *idem*, *Like Angels on Jacob’s Ladder: Abraham Abulafia, the Franciscans and Joachimism* (New York: State University of New York Press, 2007).

⁶ Significant studies of crusade preaching include P. J. Cole, *The Preaching of the Crusades to the Holy Land, 1095-1270* (Cambridge, MA: Medieval Academy of America, 1991); B. M. Kienzle, “Preaching the Cross: Liturgy and Crusade Propaganda”, in *Medieval Sermon Studies* 53 (2009), pp. 11-32; C. Maier, *Preaching the Crusades. Mendicant Friars and the Cross in the Thirteenth Century* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1994); C. Maier, *Crusade Propaganda and Ideology. Model Sermons for the Preaching of the Cross* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2000).

⁷ General studies include N. Housley, *The Later Crusades: from Lyons to Alcazar 1274-1580* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1992); A. Leopold, *How to Recover the Holy Land. The Crusade Proposals of the Late Thirteenth and Early Fourteenth Centuries* (Aldershot: Ashgate, 2000); S. Menache, “When Ideology met Reality: Clement V and the Crusade”, in M. Balard (ed.), *La papauté? et les croisades: actes du VIIe Congrès de la Society for the Study of the Crusades and the Latin East = The papacy and the crusades: proceedings of the VIIIth Conference of the Society for the Study of the Crusades and the Latin East* (Farnham, Surrey: Ashgate, 2011), pp.105-116; S. Schein, *Fideles crucis: The Papacy, the West, and the Recovery of the Holy Land, 1274-1314* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1991). See also the useful documents collected in J. Bird, E. Peters and J. M. Powell (eds.), *Crusade and Christendom. Annotated Documents in Translation from Innocent III to the Fall of Acre, 1187-1291* (Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 2013).

expressed in the model sermons. Given that preaching and sermons were an essential component of the pastoral reform movement; that, in some respects, “preaching [was] the nearest that the middle ages had to a mass medium”;⁸ that crusade sermons were probably the main avenue through which crusade ideology was spread throughout medieval society; and that many questions about Llull’s own intellectual formation linger, it makes sense to explore this relationship.

De fine has been studied previously as an important contribution to late medieval crusade ideology but the relatively recent appearance in print of a number of model crusade sermons means that no one has yet systematically analyzed Llull’s crusading texts side by side with these sermons. Nor has *De fine* been evaluated as evidence specifically for the lay reception of crusade preaching in the period of the so-called later crusades. A comparison of *De fine* and the crusade sermon models reveals distinct ideological affinities rooted in their shared religious culture of conversion and penitence, which is in turn linked to preaching; it provides insight into how crusading continued to be accepted as a spiritually meritorious activity into the later middle ages; it shows that Llull took traditional elements of crusade ideology and imaginatively co-opted them in the service of his own broader goals. In order to make an effective connection between crusade preaching and Llull’s own crusade ideology, it is first necessary to establish the significance of preaching in Llull’s own life and oeuvre, the nature of the relationship between faith and action in Llull’s thought, and the basic characteristics of his thoughts about crusading. We can then turn to a comparison of *De fine* with several foundational model crusade sermons composed by the influential preacher James of Vitry.

1. Preaching and the Penitential Life: The miniatures of the *Breviculum*

The second of the twelve beautifully executed miniatures in the *Breviculum* commemorates a pivotal episode in the story of Llull’s conversion to penitence.⁹

⁸ Maier, *Crusade Propaganda*, p. 7.

⁹ For this phrase, see the prologue to the *Vita coetanea*, pp. 30-31; M. D. Johnston, “Ramon Llull’s Conversion to Penitence,” *Mystics Quarterly* 16 (1990), pp. 179-192 and J. Gayà, “De conversione sua ad poenitentiam. Reflexiones ante la edición crítica de *Vita Coetanea*,” *EL* XXIV (1980), pp. 87-91. The miniatures come from the *Breviculum*, MS St. Peter Perg. 92 (c.1325), Badische Landesbibliothek Karlsruhe, Germany. Digital images are available on the website of the Badische Landesbibliothek Karlsruhe at <<http://the MS http://digital.blb-karlsruhe.de/id/98159>>. For the critical edition see C. Lohr *et al.*, *Breviculum seu electorium paruum Thomae Migerii (Le Myésier)*, ROL Supplementum Lullianum I (Turn-

The painting contains two adjacent scenes sharing a common background divided by a stylized tree. This presentation has the effect of showing that the action depicted in the first scene leads immediately to that of the second. In the first episode of sorts, we see a bishop, identifiable by his mitre and red cloak, standing on an elevated wooden platform outdoors. The bishop is preaching; one hand gestures to the audience seated on the grass below, listening with rapt attention. His second hand, also with finger extended, points towards nothing particular in *this* scene, but the gesture directs the viewer's attention towards the *next* scene, reinforcing the narrative connection between the two. The audience is comprised of both men and women and includes several figures bearing tunsures. Lull sits in the center of the crowd. Significantly, he is still attired in the scarlet-orange tunic with gold trim he wore in the previous miniature depicting the visions of Christ crucified which inspired his initial conversion.¹⁰ In the second scene, the bishop helps Lull to put on a humble penitential habit similar to the ones worn by the Friars Minor. The bishop looks to the sky and commends Lull's decision to follow St. Francis' example, praying for God to give Lull perseverance on his chosen path. Gone are Lull's gold-embellished robes—his conversion is complete.¹¹

In general, these types of images reveal much about medieval spirituality.¹² In particular, the miniatures described above, especially when combined with the testimony from the semi-autobiographical *Vita coetanea*, reveal what Lull and his

hout: Brepols, 1990). Both Bonner, *A Contemporary Life* and the critical edition of the *Breviculum* have color plates of the images.

¹⁰ The miniatures are on facing pages—Lull's visions of the crucified Christ on five successive days and his pilgrimages are on f. 1v and this miniature on f. 2r—and thus together form a unit.

¹¹ We can see a striking parallel between the rather lengthy process of conversion represented in these miniatures and the cycle of the *Life of St. Francis* painted by Giotto or members of his 'school' in the Church of St. Francis in Assisi which has as one of its key episodes a scene depicting Francis divesting himself of his clothes and being wrapped in a humble cloak by the local bishop. The visual allusions to the life of St. Francis accord with the text accompanying the images. See *Breviculum*, 11. The depiction of Franciscan spirituality as a model for Lull is supported by the *Vita coetanea* which notes that the sermon took place in the Franciscan convent on the feast day of St. Francis and that in it the bishop explained St. Francis' conversion experience; see Bonner, *A Contemporary Life*, p. 36.

¹² For examples of work by art historians whose contributions to the study of medieval religious culture provide useful background for understanding the miniatures, see F. Botana, *The Works of Mercy in Italian Medieval Art (c. 1050-1400)*, *Medieval Church Studies* 20 (Turnhout: Brepols, 2011), J. F. Hamburger and A. Bouché (ed.) *The Mind's Eye: Art and Theological Argument in the Middle Ages* (Princeton: Department of Art and Archaeology and Princeton University Press, 2006), H. L. Kessler, *Spiritual Seeing. Picturing God's Invisibility in Medieval Art* (Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 2000), C. Robinson, *Imagining the Passion in a Multiconfessional Castile. The Virgin, Christ, Devotions, and Images in the Fourteenth and Fifteenth Centuries* (University Park, PA: Pennsylvania State University Press, 2013).

followers thought about the process, experience and meaning of religious conversion. They provide insight into the mechanisms of preaching during Lull's lifetime. Most importantly, they present evidence of the significance of preaching for Lull's own formation and oeuvre. The two-fold scene of Lull's conversion to a life of penitence in the miniature from the *Breviculum* signals that preaching was seen as essential for inspiring action in response to conversion. The pairing of the image of Lull's attendance at the sermon with that of his assumption of a penitential costume argues that preaching required a response and that conversion demanded action. The elements of the painting noted above (shared background or setting and the bishop's finger pointing to the next scene) reinforce this view. Although Lull's process of conversion (at least according to the *Vita coetanea* and the *Breviculum*) began with his dramatic visions of Christ crucified, it was not fully accomplished until he had heard the sermon and acted upon its message. As the bishop's prayers for Lull's perseverance implied, taking up the humble garb of penitence was only his first step along the path of a new life. The subsequent 'acts' of this life are also memorialized by miniatures in the *Breviculum*.¹³ The images testify that at least for one segment of the medieval European population, Christianity wasn't just a set of precepts to be believed but rather a prescription for a way of life; in short, Christianity was something one *practiced*. Embracing a life of penitence demanded a particular *type* of practice or 'doing'. For Lull this 'doing' consisted of dedicating himself to the long process of developing his *Art*, writing many different kinds of books to facilitate similar conversions in others, and travelling almost incessantly from court to court and town to town to promote his *Art* and other proposals, which were in turn aimed at bringing the world to its appointed state.¹⁴ It turned out that Lull needed all the perseverance that the bish-

¹³ Following the first two miniatures are images depicting Lull learning Arabic and the death of his slave; receiving the divinely inspired *Art* and teaching it at Paris; three allegorical scenes representing his *Art* and its use against Aristotle and the Averroists; his first missionary journey; his travels to petition the royal and ecclesiastical courts of Europe, another missionary journey during which he was attacked; the beginnings of Le Myésier's compilation project; and the presentation of the *Breviculum* to Queen Jeanne of France. These events are also commemorated in the *Vita coetanea* which presents a slightly different order of conversion events (pilgrimage follows the sermon). This supports Lohr's contention that the *Breviculum* is not a biography as such but rather an interpretation of a Lull's life. See C. Lohr, "Das Breviculum des Thomas Le Myésier im Rahmen des Lebens und der Lehre Ramon Lulls" in *Raimundus Lullus—Thomas Le Myésier. Electorium parvum seu Breviculum. Handschrift St. Peter perg.92 der Badischen Landesbibliothek Karlsruhe. Kommentar zum Faksimile*, G. Stamm (ed.) (Wiesbaden: Dr. Ludwig Reichert Verlag, 1988), pp. 102-104. The structure of the images and the *Vita* create an interesting parallel between putting on new garments and getting a new kind of education.

¹⁴ For Lull's "intentions" see W. W. Artus, "Ramon Lull on the First and Second Intentions: a Basic Ethical Doctrine," in *Les philosophies morales et politiques au Moyen Âge*, 3 vols., B. C. Bazán et al. (ed.) (New York, 1992), vol. II, pp. 978-990.

op could acquire for him through his prayers! This miniature shows that, besides inspiring conversion, sermons were thought to provide the framework and convey the information essential for living an appropriately penitential Christian life responsive to the teaching contained in the Gospels.

Two other points should be noted about the process and nature of conversion represented in the miniatures. First, there is an interesting movement from private to public or individual to communal in the images. Second, the images visually represent the complex relationship between word and deed, the contemplative and the active, embodied in Llull's life and works. The first miniature in the *Breviculum* shows the first 'act' of Llull's conversion taking place in three successive scenes. The first depicts Llull's visions (a focus on sight rather than on the listening of the second 'act' in the second miniature); the second and third depict Llull's pilgrimage journeys to St. Mary of Rocamadour and Santiago of Compostela. As in the miniature described above, the terrifying experience (by Llull's account)¹⁵ illustrated in the first scene of this miniature leads to specific action. Llull's visions occurred in solitude, in his private chamber, next to his bed, while he was engaged in the intimate and intensely personal act of writing love poetry. The action inspired by these visions is also personal. Although we know that both of the shrines Llull is claimed to have visited were very popular destinations, and that many pilgrims traveled in groups, the artist has shown Llull as a solitary figure, carrying out a pilgrimage for uniquely individual reasons and engaged in prayer before images of the saints to whom the shrines were dedicated. This is in striking contrast to the community depicted in the second miniature. Here the preaching of the sermon is such an open event, so public, that it takes place in the open air. This setting advertises that the bishop's message is addressed to everyone. The occasion of the sermon is the feast day in celebration of a very popular saint famous for his selfless engagement with his community. Although the audience is not shown in the second scene of this miniature, hagiographical conventions tell us that taking on the garb of a penitent (just like joining a religious order) generally took place in some kind of a communal setting. In any case, Llull is not alone in this scene. He is in the presence of the Church community, which is symbolized by the bishop. Moreover, following this conversion, Llull's life will become intensely public and he will become increasingly concerned with the communal or public good.¹⁶ The

¹⁵ *Vita coaetanea*, pp. 30-33.

¹⁶ Concern for the *bonum publicum* pervades *De fine*. Llull enjoys some private periods of contemplation as well, especially in the hermitage on Mt. Randa. The tension between the private or contemplative and the public or active life is explored in many of Llull's works, most notably the *Llibre d'Evast e d'Aloma e de Blaquerna* (*Blaquerna* hereafter). For this tension in medieval thought see G. Constable,

conversion that was initiated privately and internally bears fruit publicly and communally. Words, whether written or spoken, are meant to result in action.

To summarize then, the first two miniatures in the *Breviculum* which recount the narrative of Llull's conversion highlight certain basic concepts or themes associated with preaching: preaching is central to the process of religious conversion; preaching helps bring private penitence to public fruition; preaching requires a response; and preaching helps to inspire, structure, and locate meaning in that response. It should be remembered that the very carefully constructed *Vita coetanea* is a written redaction by Llull's friends at the Carthusian monastery of Vauvert of an autobiography which, it is claimed, Llull narrated to them personally, and also that the miniatures contained in the *Breviculum* provide an equally well-structured interpretation of the *meaning* of Llull's *Vita* intended to highlight its hagiographical characteristics in order to promote Llull's ideas at the royal court.¹⁷ Both 'texts' therefore should be associated as much with Llull's community of followers and the reception of Lullian thought as they should with Llull himself. That the basic concepts linked to preaching feature so prominently in these two 'texts' is evidence both for how central the concepts were to Llull's own thought and also for how deeply those ideas had permeated medieval society. Given that the 'texts' were intended to serve the rhetorical function of persuasion, it makes sense that their authors would utilize literary and visual images that would resonate with and appeal to their respective audiences. Significantly, each of these thematic elements can be discerned (either implicitly or explicitly) in *De fine* and in the crusade sermon models we shall examine below.

2. The Centrality of Preaching in Llull's Writings

There is plenty of evidence in Llull's own corpus, especially towards the later years of his life, supporting this reading of the *Breviculum* miniatures and confirming the centrality of preaching in his thought. The most notable examples of texts primarily concerned with preaching include the *Liber de praedicatione* (op. 118) written the year before *De fine* in 1304, the *Liber praedicationis contra Iudaeos* (op. 123) written in the same year as *De fine* in 1305, the *Summa sermonum* (op. 201-207) some time later, in 1312, and finally the *Ars*

"The Interpretation of Mary and Martha" in *Three Studies in Medieval Religious and Social Thought* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1995), pp. 1-141.

¹⁷ Bonner, *A Contemporary Life*, pp. 7-14; F. Domínguez, "Idea y estructura de la *Vita Raymundi Lulli*," *EL XXVII* (1987), pp. 1-20; C. Lohr, "Das *Breviculum*," pp. 89-105.

abbreviata praedicandi (op.208) composed in 1313. Other texts not so obviously connected to preaching and sermons in their titles include the *Rhetorica nova* (op.97) of 1301, which should be considered Lull's first extensive treatment of homiletics, and, sometime towards the beginning of Lull's post conversion career between 1276-83, the *Llibre d'Evast e d'Aloma e de Blaquerna* (op.21, hereafter, *Blaquerna*), a didactic and philosophical novel, replete with examples of preaching and imbued with the moralizing values celebrated and promoted in medieval sermons.¹⁸ Thus Lull's interest in preaching spans his whole post-conversion career and is represented in both his Latin and vernacular texts, presumably in order to reach the widest possible audience, both clerical and lay. The moralizing anecdotes or *exempla* characteristic of sermons are sprinkled liberally throughout many of his works. This interest in rhetoric and the power of beautiful language is something Lull shared with the best preachers of his day. The twelfth century witnessed the beginnings of a new focus in rhetoric, especially as it could be used to develop hermeneutical strategies for Biblical studies. But coincidentally, it also led to the development of new ideas about authorship and authority, many of which Lull explored in his own works.¹⁹ His interest in language and rhetoric can even be seen in the appreciation he expresses in texts like the *Llibre del gentil e dels tres savis* for the beautiful language of the *Qur'an*. Basic catechetical prayers are embedded in the very structure of many of his works including the aforementioned *Blaquerna*.

As is evident from the dates of Lull's works on preaching, his interest in homiletics intensified at the beginning of the new century, following several bouts of profound discouragement about the reception of his Art which he expressed in poetry: the *Desconhort* (1295) and the *Cant de Ramon* (1299 or 1300). In the face of these frustrations, he turned to preaching.²⁰ It is around this time that he received from James of Aragon license to preach in the synagogues

¹⁸ For brief descriptions and information on critical editions of all these texts, see A. Fidora and J. E. Rubio (eds.), *Raimundus Lullus. An Introduction to his Life, Works and Thought*. ROL Supplementum Lullianum II (Turnhout: Brepols, 2008). On the *Rhetorica Nova*, see M. D. Johnston, *Ramon Lull's New Rhetoric. Text and Translation of Lull's Rethorica Nova* (Davis, CA: Hermagoras Press, 1994). On Lull's homiletics see *idem*, *Evangelical Rhetoric of Ramon Lull. Lay Learning and Piety in the Christian West Around 1300* (New York: Oxford University Press, 1996), especially chapter 10; F. Domínguez' introduction to the critical edition of *Ars Abbreviata Praedicandi*, ROL XVIII (Turnhout: Brepols, 1991) esp. pp. 23-31, contextualizes Lull's theory of preaching.

¹⁹ A good introductory survey is A. J. Minnis, *Medieval Theory of Authorship. Scholastic literary attitudes in the later Middle Ages* (London: Scolar Press, 1984).

²⁰ The *Vita coaetanea*, VIII.32, pp. 66-7: "Sed videns se parum uel nihil super talibus obtinere, regressus est Maioricas. Vbi trahens moram, conatus est tam disputationibus quam etiam praedicationibus trahere Saracenos innumeros ibi morantes in uiam salutis".

and mosques (October 1299).²¹ And of course, one cannot forget Llull's missionary journeys to North Africa during which he attempted to preach and dispute on the basis on his *Art*, also memorialized in the miniatures of the *Breviculum*. The essential point is that preaching was central to Llull's own conversion and evangelical activities, as attested by his *Vita* and the *Breviculum*. Moreover, the *Art* itself, along with the handful of significant treatises dedicated to preaching, points to the centrality of preaching in Llull's thought. This evidence makes it easy to speculate that Llull himself would have attended sermons—probably even crusade sermons preached in the Crown of Aragon surrounding the conquest of the Balearics at the very least. It would not, therefore, be unreasonable to see echoes of those sermons in the crusade ideology Llull himself developed.

3. Llull's Works on Crusading

The act and theory of preaching were important to both Llull himself and to the followers who promoted his ideas. We have also established that there is a confluence of ideas about conversion and penitence around preaching which Llull explored in a manner unique to him but which are drawn from a shared cultural milieu and probably resonated with a significant portion of the educated laity in Llull's time. We can now move to a consideration of how these ideas about conversion and penitence are incorporated into the crusade ideology reflected through the sermon models and in Llull's *De fine*.

De fine (op.122) is one of three treatises chiefly dedicated to the subjects of the proselytization of unbelievers (including schismatics) and crusading. These subjects were nearly inseparable in Llull's works.²² The first treatise on mission and crusade, *Liber de Passagio* (op.52) was written in 1292 shortly after the fall of Acre and was undoubtedly a response both to that disaster and to Pope

²¹ J. N. Hillgarth, *Diplomatari lul·lia* (Barcelona: Edicions de la Universitat de Barcelona, 2001).

²² On the link between mission and crusade see P. Beattie, "Pro Exaltatione sanctae fidei catholicae": Mission and Crusade in the Writings of Ramon Llull", in L. Simon (ed.), *Iberia and the Mediterranean World of the Middle Ages. Studies in Honor of Robert I. Burns S. J.* (Leiden: E. J. Brill, 1995), pp. 113-129; F. Domínguez (ed.), *Liber de Passagio*, ROL XXVIII (Turnhout: Brepols, 2003), "Introducción," pp. 257-316; B. Z. Kedar, *Crusade and Mission. European Approaches toward the Muslims* (Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press, 1984); R. Vose, *Dominicans, Muslims and Jews in the Medieval Crown of Aragon* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2009). A survey of Llull's ideas about crusade can be found in Fidora et al., *Raimundus Lullus. An Introduction*, pp. 425-429; see also A. Gottron, *Ramon Lulls Kreuzzugsideen*. Abhandlungen zur mittleren und Neueren Geschichte, Heft 39 (Berlin-Leipzig, 1912) and F. Porsia, *Progetti di Crociata. Il De fine di Raimondo Lullo* (Taranto: Chimienti Editore, 2005).

Nicholas IV's call for advice on the Holy Land, reunification with the Greek Church and unification of the military orders. It is comprised of two distinct but obviously related works: a letter addressed to Pope Nicholas IV which had the title *Quomodo Terra sancta recuperari potest* and a piece called *Tractatus de modo conuertendi infideles*.²³ It contains the seeds of ideas that would find fuller expression in *De fine*, Lull's second treatise on crusading, which Lull composed in Montpellier during the spring of 1305 (about which more below). The *Liber de Passagio* is more optimistic about the possibility of a Mongol alliance than *De fine*, and not as insistent upon the creation of a single military order, focusing more on cooperation between existing orders as distinct parts of a unified whole.²⁴ The third crusading text is *Liber de acquisitione Terrae sanctae* (op.146). Lull wrote this short treatise also in Montpellier four years after *De fine*, in the spring of 1309, with the aim of presenting it to Pope Clement V. It incorporates into its recommendations some of the crusading ambitions of James II of Aragon. An interesting feature of both *De fine* and *Liber de acquisitione Terrae sanctae* is the inclusion of brief anecdotes which Lull used as *exempla*; this reflects Lull's great interest in preaching and his indebtedness to *artes praedicandi* as a source for the rhetorical strategies he came to employ towards the end of his life. Because *Liber de acquisitione Terrae sanctae* is in many respects a condensed version of *De fine*, its use of *exempla* is more prominent; in structure, the text actually bears some resemblance to sermon models. An important difference between the two texts is that *De acquisitione Terrae sanctae* had to take into consideration the affair of the Templars.²⁵ Together with *De fine* it is representative of the crusading strategies championed and promoted by James II while the earlier *Liber de Passagio* can be considered subtly reflective of Angevin ambitions.²⁶

²³ For a description and analysis see Domínguez, *Liber de passagio*, pp. 257-316. Lull also sent petitions promoting crusading and the establishment of language studia for missionaries to Popes Boniface VIII and Clement V (Op. 59 and Op. 60). He addressed crusading in some of his vernacular works such as *Blaquerna*. He included crusading proposals in the advisory treatise he prepared for the general church council of Vienne in 1311 (Op. 188: *Liber de ente, quod simpliciter est per se and propter se existens et agens*).

²⁴ The two parts of *De passagio* actually each advocate a different approach; one suggests cooperation between the military orders and the other, probably in direct response to Nicholas' own request, their unification.

²⁵ A survey of the Templar affair is in C. Tyerman, *God's War. A New History of the Crusades* (Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 2006), pp. 838-843; the best extensive treatment is M. Barber, *The Trial of the Templars* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1978); see also A. J. Forey, *The Military Orders from the twelfth to the early fourteenth century* (Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1992).

²⁶ See J. N. Hillgarth, *Ramon Lull and Lullism in fourteenth-century France* (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1971), pp. 64-71. For the general political entanglements of crusade plans, see the works cited in note 7 above.

In Llull's words, the purpose of *De fine* was to provide the papal curia and other Christian leaders the material with which they could, with the aid of Christ's grace, "return the whole world (*universum*) to a good state and unify [it] into one catholic fold,"²⁷ and he intended it to be his last word on the subject. The title is deliberately ambiguous and plays on the multiple meanings of the word *finis*. It refers simultaneously to Llull's first intention (the 'end' towards which humankind should strive); the main goal of his own life and writings; his final articulation of the specific parameters of his proposals for missions and crusade; and, in an eschatological sense, the accomplishment of the last things which were prerequisites for the arrival of the end of salvation history—Judgment Day. *De fine* is organized into three *distinctiones* prefaced by a brief rationale for writing the text and presenting it to the curia. All three meanings of the title can be discerned in this prologue. The *distinctiones* discuss in the following order, these topics: *De disputatione infidelium* (on the establishment of missionary *studia* and advice for the business of converting Muslims, Jews, schismatics and Tartars); *De modo bellandi* (the organization and rule for a unified military order, possible routes for crusading armies or places where they can engage in crusading, military matters pertaining both to campaigns fought on land and on sea, preaching, and the various trades necessary for the success of the crusading army); and *De exaltatione intellectus* (a two part list of his own books necessary for increasing human understanding and knowledge and, ultimately, for the success of Llull's proposals; the list consists of the *Ars generalis* and twenty applications of the Art on specific subjects). *De fine* concludes with a short exhortatory recapitulation of the key ideas from the prologue and an expression of Llull's conviction that his plans would greatly benefit the public good. In *De fine*, Llull uses *exempla* in the *distinctio* where he discusses strategies to convert unbelievers through preaching and disputation. The treatise is of moderate length. Its tone, structure and contents were clearly influenced by general historical circumstances and significant events in Llull's life. Examples of the latter include the final closure of Miramar several years prior, the general realization in the West that hopes for a Mongol alliance were ephemeral, and Llull's travels to Cyprus (and possibly to Jerusalem itself).²⁸

²⁷ A. Madre (ed.), *De fine*, ROL IX (Turnhout: Brepols, 1981), p. 251: "Sed propono finaliter domino papae et aliis quibusdam principibus seu rectoribus fidei christianae mittere istum librum. In quo libro continetur materia, per quam posset, mediante si uellent gratia Iesu Christi, ad bonum statum reducere uniuersum et ad unum ouile catholicum adunire".

²⁸ See J. Gayà, "Ramon Llull en Oriente (1301-1302): Circunstancias de un viaje", *SL XXXVII* (1997), pp. 25-78.

De fine is an appropriate text to compare to the model crusade sermons and other treatises on crusade preaching because it contains Llull's most extensively elaborated thoughts on crusading, contextualized by statements about his main goals. Moreover, it was written at the beginning of the period during which he seems to have been most interested in the subject of preaching and wrote most of his major homiletic works. It is possible to compare *De fine* to a range of published model sermons which range in date and authorship.²⁹ A survey of these sermons by a variety of authors representing different religious orders highlights consistencies and variations in the crusading themes and images according to time, religious sensibilities, and circumstance.

4. Preaching the Crusade and Sermon Models

It is important to remember that preaching the crusade was a carefully orchestrated endeavor, calculated to reach the widest possible audience and appeal to a broad range of social groups. Crusade preaching was systematic and closely related to fundraising for crusade campaigns. It is logical then that the crusade sermon models should express an equally wide range of crusade ideals. Maier's study of the sermon models makes it clear that they cannot be considered conclusive evidence of what the friars actually preached. The sermon models themselves are didactic, composed in such a way as to inspire crusade preachers 'out in the field' and to provide them with the intellectual tools for effective preaching in the greatest number of different circumstances.³⁰ Cole's study of crusade preaching explains the dependent relationship between the crusade ideology articulated in papal bulls and encyclicals and that ideology disseminated to the public via preaching.³¹ Conversely, as mentioned above, in order to be effective sermons had to touch the emotions and imaginations of their audience. The sermons had to couch the teaching of the Church in language that was accessible and use examples that made sense to people from varied walks of life and with varying degrees of education and worldly experience.

²⁹ There are accounts and editions of sermons from the time of Urban II's call for the First Crusade and continuing into the fourteenth century preached by a range of ecclesiastics including secular and regular clergy and mendicants. The influence and importance of each of these preachers reached beyond the confines of their immediate communities. For a survey of the authors of these sermons and their context, see Cole, *The Preaching of the Crusades* (contains crusade sermons in the appendices); Maier, *Crusade Propaganda*, chapter 1; *idem*, *Preaching the Crusades*, Appendix 2, pp. 170-174.

³⁰ *Ibid.*, p. 116; see also Maier, *Crusade Propaganda*, ch. 2, pp. 17-31.

³¹ Cole, *The Preaching of the Crusades*, *passim*, and especially ch. 7, pp. 177-217; and Maier, *Crusade Propaganda*, pp. 25-28.

Preaching, then, provided a point of intersection between ‘official’ crusade theology endorsed by the leaders of the church and the religious sensibilities of the medieval public.³² Sermon models and *ad status* sermon collections also served as a bridge—this time between ‘live’ crusade preaching and treatises written as crusade propaganda. Official teaching and popular understanding of the crusades came together in the sermons and in the propagandistic treatises.

A comparison between James of Vitry’s model sermons and Lull’s *De fine* is an appropriate starting point for an exploration of the affinities between Lull’s crusade ideology and crusade preaching.³³ James of Vitry was one of the most important preachers of his time. A large number of his sermons have survived and studies have shown that they were extremely influential as sources for later preachers. Maier has shown that preachers such as Gilbert of Tournai and Humbert of Romans, who were actually contemporaries to Lull, drew on James’ sermons for inspiration, incorporating his images and ideas into their own works.³⁴ James’ crusade sermons were informed by his vast experience preaching both the Albigensian and the Fifth Crusades and serving in the Holy Land as bishop of Acre. James’ intellectual and religious formation took place during the Paris reform movement and he was strongly influenced by those ideals. James thus creates a bridge between the pastoral reforms of the late twelfth century and the rise of mendicant spirituality which so influenced Lull. The crusade ideology preached by James in his sermons tightly bound moral reform together with participation in crusading. We will look at select aspects of three of the sermon models included in the collections that James composed during the last years of his life.³⁵

32 Most contemporary criticism of crusading seems to take place in this connection, particularly in relation to financial abuses or when there was some kind of disharmony or a disconnect between ideals and actions. See E. Siberry, *Criticism of Crusading 1095-1274* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1985) and P. A. Throop, *Criticism of the Crusade: a Study of Public Opinion and Crusade Propaganda* (Amsterdam: Swets & Zeitlinger, 1940).

33 Although I have studied the relationship between Lull’s ideas and those expressed in the later model sermons, their inclusion in the present essay would make it impossibly long.

34 James of Vitry is perhaps more widely known as Jacques de Vitry. However, since I am primarily depending on the editions of his model sermons by Maier and the translation of one of his sermons by Bird et al, who refer to him as James, I am following suit. A vast bibliography on James and his preaching exists. For a brief introduction, see Maier, *Crusade Ideology*, pp. 9-10. On the appropriation of James’ sermon material by later preachers, see *ibid.*, pp. 250-263, which contains an appendix meticulously detailing how Gilbert of Tournai incorporated and adapted materials from James’ model crusade sermons into his own. See also the introductory note to James’ Sermon to Pilgrims translated by Bird et al., *Crusade and Christendom*, p. 141.

35 James sermons are quite long. As the century goes on, the sermon models tend to become more schematic and abbreviated—Lull’s treatises on preaching are characteristic of that tendency; see Mark D. Johnston, *The Evangelical Rhetoric of Ramon Lull: Lay Learning and Piety in the Christian West around 1300* (New York and Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1996), pp. 157-179.

5. James of Vitry's *Sermon to Pilgrims: Repentance, Virtuous Action, and Community*

The first sermon model to be considered is addressed to pilgrims but the text makes it clear that James' imagined audience is comprised specifically of pilgrims who have taken a crusade vow. Therefore this sermon was meant to instruct listeners how best they could fulfill their vow, providing guidelines for the type of behavior appropriate for pilgrims and soldiers of Christ and encouraging them on their journey. Official expectations of crusader conduct and morals were high (comparable to the ideals held up for members of the religious orders). In reality crusaders often fell short of these ideals; their moral failures could be used to explain military failures (*peccatis nostris exigentibus* is the phrase frequently used in this context). Certainly, in Lull's lifetime, this was one of the main explanations given for the fall of Acre.³⁶ On the other hand, if crusaders adhered to their vows and campaigned in a moral and upright manner, they could expect both corporate reward—victory in battle—and individual reward—indulgences granted for the forgiveness of the penalties of sin. James' sermon to pilgrims is a good example of the transference of the penitential theology of pilgrimage to the business of crusading that came to be increasingly emphasized throughout the thirteenth century.³⁷

Using a theme drawn from the final chapter of *Zechariah*, James makes an analogy between Old Testament participation in the feast of the tabernacles and contemporary pilgrimage. James calls upon his audience to:

...observe this feast of pilgrimage with spiritual rejoicing, for whether you live or die you will belong to the Lord. If you live, it will be fortunate for you, because you will return with the treasure of an accomplished indulgence, absolved from all your sins. If in fact you die to this world in the Lord's service it is better for you because you will cross over to eternal joy. So then, whatever might happen to you, be it life or death, you out to rejoice.³⁸

³⁶ These ideas were first expressed around the time of the Second Crusade in Pope Eugene's crusade bull, *Quantum predecessores*; see Cole, *The Preaching of the Crusades*, p. 4; St. Bernard of Clairvaux treated the disaster in his "Tractatus de consideratione ad Eugenium Papam", in *Opera*, J. Leclercq *et al.* (ed.), 8 vols. (Rome: Editiones Cistercienses, 1957-78), vol. 3, pp. 393-493. Human sinfulness was also blamed for the fall of Acre; for the main sources see R. H. C. Huygens, *Excidii Aconis gestorum collectio; Magister Thadeus civis Neapolitanus, Ystoria de desolation et conculcatione civitatis Acconensis et totius Terre Sanctae*, CCCM 202 (Turnhout: Brepols, 2004).

³⁷ I could not locate a critical edition so am using the translation in Bird *et al.*, *Crusade and Christendom*, pp. 143-158. James' text will be referred to as "Sermon to pilgrims" hereafter.

³⁸ Sermon to pilgrims, pp. 143-144.

He relates this pilgrimage to the Old Testament concept of expiation and emphasizes that the feast is for sinners. He declares, "Certainly, the baggage of pilgrimage consists of a contrite heart and the confession of sins with which we go out from Egypt and migrate from vices to virtues".³⁹ He urges his audience to respond to God's invitation and "go up to the feast," stressing that "today" is the time to do so. He uses the image of the cross as an inspirational symbol and promise of the aid that penitent sinners can expect to receive on their pilgrimage journey.⁴⁰ It is clear that the pilgrims addressed are those who have taken crusading vows, some of whom may not yet have acted upon that vow. This part of the sermon ties repentance to penitential behavior, in this case participation in a public and communal pilgrimage—namely the crusade. The movement is from private intent to public action.

In the next part of the sermon, James focuses on the type of moral behavior expected of this group of pilgrims as a prerequisite for the success of the pilgrimage. After enumerating the various temptations which a crusader-pilgrims might expect to encounter along their journey, James offers advice about how to avoid them. Because they are participating in a just war against unjust adversaries and because they have a good conscience and "the aid of God, the angels, the saints, the suffrages of the church triumphant, and the prayers and merits of the church militant" they need not be afraid.⁴¹ Crusaders must be on their guard against temptation lest one carnal pleasure negate all the sacrifices they have already made. He encourages them to respond to the "insinuator" (the devil) by saying:

I deserted my wife and children for Christ, and ...for the Lord's sake I conquered longing for my homeland and every fleshly affliction. I spent much money in the Lord's service; I exposed myself to the perils of the sea and many other things. I do not want to lose all this for the sake of one base passion.⁴²

Those in a state of sin should not expect victory: "In fact, we should fear the sins of Christians more than the Saracen forces. For our sin makes them powerful".⁴³ Pilgrim-crusaders must be instructed in moral virtue and embrace a virtuous way of life. This will also enable them to serve as good examples for others. For this reason, James encourages his listeners to take the cross publicly.⁴⁴ The action of taking the vow and embarking on the journey represents the fruition of repentance:

³⁹ Ibid., p. 144

⁴⁰ Ibid., p. 145

⁴¹ Ibid., p. 148.

⁴² Ibid., p. 150.

⁴³ Ibid., p. 149

⁴⁴ Ibid., p. 145

Indeed this is a reason for exultation and gladness because the wood of the cross bore its fruit which was made manifest in those signed with the cross, who expressly follow the Crucified so that they might obtain the indulgence of sins and the fruit of eternal salvation which will come to be through the grace of the Holy Spirit and the teaching of preachers.⁴⁵

James emphasizes the public benefit (provision of good moral example) that will result from engaging in the crusade pilgrimage. The value of crusading is therefore threefold: military victory over Christ's enemies and the recovery of the Holy Land; victory over death earned by the individual penitent through indulgences; and the amelioration (reform) of Christian society.

There is an urgency to this undertaking. James points to the inexorable passage of time and encourages his listeners not to delay:

For how very soon we will yearn for a support in this long life unless we possess assurance, for just as days and nights fly by quickly, so our pilgrimage swiftly heads toward death. No ship sails so violently or swiftly that it cannot be held back by any means. Yet our pilgrimage and our voyage to death cannot be checked nor does it ever rest. For this very reason the stubborn and obstinate who do not want to be signed with the cross for Christ's sake, whether or not they desire it, are pilgrims who every day make one day's journey toward death and into hell.⁴⁶

The urgency for taking up the cross not only derives from the fear of hell, but also arises out of the necessity to express gratitude to God for his gift of salvation. James invokes the cross as symbolic of that gift:

How wretched and ungrateful are those who always want to receive benefits from the Lord and yet never want to respond to him...The Lord served us upon the cross such that he said to the hammer and nails fixing him to it as is commonly said: "hold tightly". And yet we do not want to serve him...We run into danger on rivers and nonetheless do not want to cling to the tree which, firmly rooted, is safe from the water's waves. However, he truly has an iron heart who cannot be saved by the nail by which hell itself was emptied...There is hardly a fool or even a child who would not willingly accept what he was given and yet you do not want to accept the remission of sins and heavenly kingdom which is offered to you.⁴⁷

James incorporates into his sermon the church teaching on crusading seen in crusade bulls and encyclicals. These increasingly stress the connection between penance, grateful response to the gift of salvation, crusading, and the indul-

⁴⁵ *Ibid.*, p. 145.

⁴⁶ *Ibid.*, p. 150.

⁴⁷ *Ibid.*, pp. 150-151.

gences offered as a reward for participation.⁴⁸ James concludes his sermon with a series of *exempla* which reinforce these concepts, but not before warning his audience: “You ought truly to fear lest this be the final and peremptory summons!”⁴⁹

6. Echoes of James’ Penitential Crusade Ideology in *De Fine*

De fine reflects the three main points made by James of Vitry in his sermon addressed to pilgrims and incorporates several of James’ images. We can recognize Lull himself in the passage where James writes of the pilgrim leaving all behind to answer God’s call; the *Vita coetanea* presents Lull’s life as an embodiment of just this notion of sacrificial vocation. Lull adapts James’ image of a penitent sinner “[going] into exile by wandering and laboring for Christ”⁵⁰ to frame his own call for action when, in the opening paragraph of *De fine*, he recounts his own abandonment of all worldly pleasures in order to embrace a life of penitence.⁵¹ His own life becomes an *exemplum* to persuade his audience that his message is legitimate. This autobiographical reference is paralleled by another at the end of the treatise, effectively framing it in a manner reminiscent of literary “frame tales”.⁵² Briefer personal anecdotes are sprinkled throughout the

⁴⁸ For the development of the idea of the crusade as penance and discussion of the relevant papal bulls and encyclicals, see Cole, *The Preaching of the Crusades*, pp. 142-176.

⁴⁹ Sermon to pilgrims, 152.

⁵⁰ *Ibid.*, p. 150.

⁵¹ *De fine*, p. 250: “Et quia christiani ad hunc statum prauissimum et iniustum quasi remedium nolunt dare, idcirco quidam homo dimisit omnia, quae habebat, et diu per consequens laborauit, quasi per mudum eundo uniuersum...”. The situation he is referring to here is the shame incurred by Christians who are not doing enough to remedy the Muslims’ denial of Christian truth and their possession of the Holy Land.

⁵² The idea that Lull himself is an *exemplum*, is underscored at the end of the third *distinctio* (*De exaltatione intellectus*) which explains how his own works based on the *Art* can help to achieve the elevation of the intellect. The biographical note inserted here provides a segue to the epilogue where he expresses his frustration at the neglect of his *Art*: Et quia praedictas Artes non possum in mundo ad placitum radicare, immo propter hoc sum neglectus, ex eo quia pomposae scientiae, uel etiam lucratiuae, uolant et ambient ipsum mundum. Propter publicam utilitatem, quam uideo in praedictis, languo et uiuo in tristitia et dolore, et uado per mundum uniuersum. Et qui me impedit, audiat, si mentales aures habeat, quantum contra bonum publicum hic consistit”. *De fine*, pp. 289-290. Another striking example of the expression of such sentiments is Lull’s poem *Desconort*; similar references are scattered throughout his texts. L. Badia, “Ramon Lull: autor i personatge”, analyzes how Lull used these biographical anecdotes to construct various fictionalized identities. See also R. Szpiech, *Conversion and Narrative. Reading and Religious Authority in Medieval Polemic* (Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 2013), pp. 134-142.

text, especially in his *exempla* on missionary preaching. This explains why Lull declares with such confidence, multiple times in the treatise, that all his efforts promoting his plans will ensure that he will be able to stand excused in the presence of the Judge on Judgment Day.⁵³ The wandering exiles in James' sermon embrace the suffering and poverty of crusade pilgrimage rather than riches and pleasures. In accepting the cross (professing a crusade vow), they assume the apostolic life.⁵⁴ In framing the proposals of *De fine* with autobiographical *exempla*, Lull presents his own ceaseless promotion of his plans at ecclesiastical and royal courts across Christendom as his personal pilgrimage journey, his penitential response to conversion, his unique method of being a *crucesignatus*.

James and Lull draw upon the same imagery of a wandering exile and invoke the same apostolic life in order to link penitential theology with the actions they are promoting. In James's case, the action is acceptance of the cross and perseverance in the crusade pilgrimage. In Lull's case, the action is three-fold: preaching to and disputing with unbelievers, participating in crusade campaigns, and elevating the mind by studying the *Art*. The connection between penitence and Lull's proposals goes beyond his autobiographical examples and can also be seen in his recommendations for the type of person who should to engage in the preaching, fighting and scholarship he promotes. For example, Lull suggests that those who go to study at his missionary/language schools should be learned and desirous of suffering death for Christ's sake.⁵⁵ Later, he points out that if his plans for the organization of a unified military order are followed, many people will support the crusading endeavor: "For there are many people desiring to die on behalf of our Lord Jesus Christ".⁵⁶ In his final *distinctio*, *De exaltatione intellectus*, Lull implies that those who have stood in the way of the success of his *Art* have done so because, in contrast to those who are willing to take up the *negotium* he recommends, they have more worldly interests.⁵⁷ Those who neglect Lull's proposals and his *Art* provide a negative

⁵³ Lull expresses this idea directly or implies it about ten times in this treatise. The first example is in the prologue. *De fine*, p. 251: "Cum quo excuse me Deo Patri et etiam iustissimo suo Nato et sancto Spiritui, corda hominum perscrutanti (cf. I Cor. 2, 10), deinde beatissimae Virgini, genitrici Dei filii incarnate, et toti curiae civium supernorum. Quoniam in isto negotio facere plus non possum, ex eo quia quasi solus sum in tractando, et neminem quodam nodo inuenio, qui me iuuet".

⁵⁴ E. g. in the Sermon to Pilgrims, 145.

⁵⁵ *De fine*, p. 250: "[...] aliqui ualentes homines literati, pro Christo desiderantes mortem pati [...]". Compare *ibid.*, p. 253: "[...] tales deuotos homines litteratos, qui cum ardenti desiderio affectarent addiscere illas linguas, ita quod cum magna caritate et patientia laborem et fastidia uellent pati, et mori finaliter pro illo benignissimo Dei Filio [...]".

⁵⁶ *Ibid.*, p. 272: "Nam multi sunt desiderantes mori propter nostrum Dominum Iesum Christum".

⁵⁷ See above, note 43.

example of the apostolic life. The connections that Lull makes between penitence and participation in his projects emphasize the concept of the *imitatio Christi* differently than James. James holds Christ up as an inspirational ideal; Lull holds him up as someone to be emulated. Lull's ideals are subtly illustrative of the impact which mendicant preaching had on the theological concepts of penance. They reflect the penetration of mendicant ideals of *imitatio Christi* into the population of the educated laity by Lull's time.

The proposals advanced in *De fine* are rooted in penitential ideals with the result that it stresses moral instruction and behavior just as James did in his sermon. In fact, the success of Lull's proposals depends upon it. Lull underscores the causal connection between virtue and military success by including an entire subsection on preaching (*De praedicatione*) in his second *distinctio* (*De modo bellandi*).⁵⁸ He recommends that the leader of this unified military order, the *bellator rex*, should include in his order learned men, preaching to their brothers. Their primary task would be to provide instruction in the theological virtues. Lull argues that such knowledge would assist the warriors in living virtuous lives and avoiding vice. To help the preachers, Lull recommends his own *De praedicatione*, cementing the link between preaching, the life of Christian virtue, and crusading success.⁵⁹ Other duties of these preachers should include singing mass, hearing confessions, reciting the hours and generally exercising the office of the holy Church.⁶⁰ All of these measures highlight the concept of crusading as a religious vocation and add to our understanding of the liturgical dimension of crusading. One could argue that the persistence of the connection that James made in his sermon between moral virtue and military success, and which is manifest in *De fine*, is evidence that Lull's ideas were old-fashioned. However, it should be seen as evidence that Lull had so internalized the penitential ideas about a moral Christian life and their connection with pilgrimage

⁵⁸ This is important evidence for the continuity of certain basic aspects of crusade ideology from the time of James of Vitry into the era of the *passagium particulare* and post-Acre crusade propaganda. For a survey of these crusade proposals, Leopold, *How to Recover the Holy Land*.

⁵⁹ *De fine*, p. 282: "Bellator rex habeat ordinatos scientes, suis fratribus praedicantes. Et modo duplici istud fiat. Primus modus quo ad animam, uidelicet eis, quae sunt uirtutes theologicae et morales, ostendendo, et modum, per quem oriuntur, crescent et minuuntur, et etiam connexantur. Et sic similiter de peccatis...Et ad hoc est peroptimus quidam liber, quem De praedicatione fecimus. In quo est ars etiam praedicandi...Et talis modus praedicandi est ualde laudabilis atque bonus, quoniam peccatores per ipsum possunt cognoscere in se ipsis modum, per quem ad uirtutes et ad uitia hi se habent; et per talem cognitionem possunt se habere artificialiter ad uirtutes et a uitiiis prolongare".

⁶⁰ *Ibid.*, p. 282: "Tales clerici siue religiosi cantando missas, audiendo confessions, dicendo horas et huiusmodi, officium sacrosanctae ecclesiae exercebunt. Et fratres ordinis in istis habebunt maiorem deuotionem eiusdem ordinis, quam si de alio ordine hi fuissent".

and crusade which preachers had been circulating since the Fourth Lateran council, that he was able to embody them personally and incorporate them in an innovative way into his own writings on crusading.⁶¹

We saw that James argued that penitents should take the cross in public and wear the cross openly to set an example for Christian society. In his view, crusading pilgrims follow the example of the prophet in Ezekiel who “was commanded to go into exile by day before them [the Hebrews] so that he might provide a good example for others”.⁶² James’ interest in having the members of his audience provide a “good example,” underscores the general sentiment pervading this whole sermon, which is that penitential pilgrimage and participation in the crusade work for the public good of Christendom. Llull is likewise convinced that his plans will aid in bringing the whole world to a good state. He explains this towards the end of *De fine* where he explains: “On account of public usefulness, which I see in the aforesaid things, I languish and I live in sadness and woe, and I wander throughout the whole world”.⁶³ He commends his work to the Holy Spirit, expressing confidence that the Holy Spirit will aid his plans because they were made and promoted on account of the common good. Because his plans accord with the virtues and are in opposition to the vices, he implies that those refuse to support them sin against the Holy Spirit. The benefits Christendom could enjoy by following his plans would include the end of the heresies, errors and dissensions amongst Christians, which stand in the way of the public good; the exaltation of the holy faith, including increased interest in supporting the *bellator rex*; peace and harmony between princes and prelates, communes and their citizens. Whoever stands in the way of the recommendations Llull has made will perpetrate great wrong and greatly impede the good.⁶⁴ Llull’s interest in the public good is unmistakable and just like James, he ties that good to individual penitential action.

Both men acknowledge the power of example and use that power to promote their ends. An important characteristic of *De fine* is how Llull tends to generalize from his own experience of conversion to penitence and his struggle to pursue an apostolic life, to prescribe the same devotion and itinerant (even pilgrim-like) way of life for the members of the military order, for the preachers who

⁶¹ Comparison of Llull’s crusade ideology to the crusade sermons of his closer contemporaries, Humbert of Romans and Gilbert of Tournai, suggests that the latter opinion is more valid.

⁶² Sermon to Pilgrims, 145. Compare James’ Sermon to Crusaders II, in Maier, *Crusade Ideology*, pp. 100-127 at pp. 122-123.

⁶³ *De fine*, pp. 289-90; see text in note 43 above.

⁶⁴ *Ibid.*, p. 290: “Et ideo qui contra praedictam ordinationem erit, quantum malum, consideret, perperabit, et quantum bonum impedit in hoc mundo. Et sic de sancto Spiritu timorem habeat, sicut dixi”.

accompany them, and for the missionaries he hoped would be trained in the *studia* whose establishment he was promoting. In fact, since his recommendations for missionary *studia* and their work of stemming the tide of unbelievers through preaching precedes his discussion on military crusading, one can argue that Lull sets up the missionaries as a moral model for crusaders.⁶⁵ One can replace preaching with fighting to create the ideal Christian knight.⁶⁶

De fine shares the sense of urgency evident in James' sermon to pilgrims. This partially can be explained by historical circumstance. James' sermons, written in the context of the Fifth Crusade, necessarily responded to the disappointments and failures in the Holy Land suffered by the Christians since the loss of Jerusalem in 1187. Likewise, Lull's treatise responded to the disappointing campaigns of Louis IX to Tunis, the fall of Acre in 1291, and the realization after around 1300 that the possible alliance with the Mongols was simply an ephemeral dream. But the urgency can also be attributed to the reforming sensibilities of both men who had experienced the contrast between the troubles of the Holy Land and the wealth and of western Christendom first hand. Lull highlights this contrast in *De fine*. He urges the pope and his curia to put his plans into action and suggests that only a lack of will can stand in their way. In order to spur them on to action he compares the altar of St. Peter's in Rome and its attendant elaborate liturgical celebrations with the pitiful state of the altar in Jerusalem, "which is the exemplar and lord of all others" and the desecration of the city.⁶⁷ This description echoes the laments which frequently prefaced papal

⁶⁵ *De fine*, p. 250: In the prologue Lull explains that he has left everything and traveled around the world "[...] adeo ut posset protinus impetrare cum domino papa, dominis cardinalibus et etiam aliis principibus huius mundi remedium et iuuamen ad tale malum magnum et maxime inhonestum, si posset, penitus euitandum, procurans tali modo, dominus papa et domini cardinales et etiam alii principes supra dicti aliqua monasteria aedificari concederent et construi, in quibus aliqui ualentes homines litterati, pro Christo desiderantes mortem pati, diuersas linguas infidelium addicerent et audirent, ut per consequens per uniuersum mundum irent euangelium praedicatum, sicut praecepit noster Dominus Iesus Christus, qui dixit sancto Petro (Ioh. 21, 17): *Petre, si amas me, pasce oues meas*".

⁶⁶ See Richard W. Kaeuper, *Holy Warriors: The Religious Ideology of Chivalry* (Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 2009). Lull's advice on chivalry or the religious behavior appropriate to knights appears in a number of his vernacular works, including *Libre de l'orde de cavalleria*, *Doctrina Pueril*, *Blaquerna* and *Felix*. Examination of these texts in light of crusade ideology would be extremely useful but also would extend this study to impossible length.

⁶⁷ *De fine*, pp. 272-3: "Et ideo, papa domine, et oh etiam domini cardinales, pro Deo concipiatis electionem uobis dictam. Nam si uos uultis, factum est; sin autem, non erit factum. Heu, quanta distantia inter tale uelle et tale nolle sic consistit. Et inter tale bonum et malum. Ergo negotium mentaliter, uocaliter et manualiter acceptetis. Ego pluries coram altari beati Petri fui Romae. Ipsum uidi ualde ornatum, illuminatum, dominum papam hic pluries cum cardinalibus celebrantem, et cum altis et multis uocibus laudantes, benedicentes nostrum Dominum Iesus Christum. Sed aliud altare est, quod est exem-

crusade bulls and which were regularly included in crusade sermons.⁶⁸ It is also another example of how Lull imaginatively incorporated the rhetorical strategies of crusade preaching to promote his own aims. Lull regularly addresses his audience in the second person (e.g., “you cardinals” and “Oh, holy Church, what enemies you have”),⁶⁹ a rhetorical technique that provides immediacy to his arguments and elicits the sense of urgency he is striving to express.

James prodded his listeners to respond to his sermon because time was steadily marching on and death (and judgment) was approaching. He emphasized the need to respond to God’s call in gratitude for the gift of salvation and hinted that the opportunity to gain the reward of indulgences would not always be available. His references to final judgment are fairly general and designed to spur the members of his audience to take up the cross and to behave in a manner appropriate for a penitent *crucesignatus* (the stick to accompany the proverbial carrot). Lull also refers to the passage of time, as for example when he reminds the leaders of the church that seventy years have elapsed since the Tartars came down from the mountains and now they have more dominion in this world than the Saracens and even the Christians.⁷⁰ However, his references to Judgment Day in *De fine* are much more specific and frequent than James’, and he clearly establishes an eschatological framework for his proposals. As mentioned above, even the title of this treatise is suggestive of this context, which he establishes in a number of different ways. First, he emphasizes that the world is in a terrible state and will only get worse if the pope and his curia show no will to stop it. Second, he repeatedly uses the specter of impending judgment give force to his words, contrasting the inaction of his audience with his own action. More than

plar et dominus omnium aliorum. Et quando uidi, in ipso duae lampades solae erant; una tamen fracta est. Ciuitas depopulata est, eo quia ibi quasi quinquaginta homines non morantur; sed hic multi serpents in cauernulis commorantur; et illa ciuitas est excellentissima super omnes alias ciuitates; et hoc intelligo quo ad Deum”.

⁶⁸ Innocent III’s *Post miserabile*, of 1198 opens with just such a lament; See Bird *et al.*, *Crusade and Christendom*, pp. 28-42; Gregory IX’s *Rachel suum videns*, of 1234, opens in the same way, *ibid.*, pp. 269-276. Lull may have encountered the bulls directly. Copies were sent to the mendicant convents, circulated in ecclesiastical courts and incorporated into registers and chronicles. On the Spanish crusading bulls see J. Goñi-Gaztambide, *Historia de la Bula de la Cruzada en España*, Victoriensia 4 (Vitoria: Editorial del Seminario, 1958). He includes a chapter on Lull. For the general organization of mendicant involvement in crusade preaching, see Maier, *Preaching the Crusades*, chapter 4. Lull could also have come into contact with such ideas through contemporary literature. On the role played by the Holy Sepulchre in the imagination of the Christian West, see C. Morris, *The Sepulchre of Christ and the Medieval West: from the beginning to 1600* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2005).

⁶⁹ For example, *De fine*, p. 268.

⁷⁰ *Ibid.*, p. 268: “Nam septuaginta anni sunt elapsi, quod Tartari a montibus descenderunt; et habent plus de dominio in hoc mundo, quam inter Saracenos et omnes etiam christianos”.

once he declares that he will be able to stand excused in the presence of the Judge; he has done all he can. Whether or not the efforts of the curia have been sufficient to earn them the same excuse, only God knows.⁷¹ We saw above that Llull's recommendations for penitential behavior were generalized from his own personal experience. The same process is at work here. By inserting himself into this eschatological framework, he changes a standard penitential trope into something that the reader has to take seriously. Llull's urgency seems to be inspired by more than circumstance and betrays distinctly eschatological anxieties. Third, he negatively compares the fervor and increase of the Church in the apostolic era to the situation of his own time, wondering why the church isn't expanding and then answering his own question with the reason that there are no martyrs in his time.⁷² Llull reminds the pope and cardinals of how well they will be rewarded for carrying out his plans and implores them to "Begin, for God's sake, begin".⁷³ One important distinction between James' sermon to pilgrims and *De fine* is that the recommendations for action contained in the latter seem to stem more from a desire to imitate the sacrificial acts of Christ and from a sense of penitential obligation than they do from a sense of gratitude.

The use of the symbol of the cross as an organizing principle for crusade sermons was fairly traditional, even by James' time. James himself uses the cross as a galvanizing force and a source of inspiration in connection with each one of the three main aspects of crusade ideology we have discussed. What is interesting is that Llull incorporates a similar emphasis on the symbolism of the cross in *De fine*. In the section discussing the unified military order he is proposing, Llull offers a lengthy description of the habit and general appearance which the order should adopt. His primary reason for extensive treatment of the organiza-

⁷¹ Ibid., p. 251: "Tunc super ipsos iudicium quale erit, non est licitum mihi scire; solum illi pertinent, qui sciuit Omnia ab aeterno". Llull refers to the inexorable passing of time, the increasingly bad state of the world, and the idea of accountability on Judgment Day on at least ten separate occasions in this text.

⁷² Ibid., p. 254: "Fides catholica incepit cum praedicatione, et multiplicata fuit cum sanctitate, sanguine et labore. Vnde sequitur, quod sua multiplicatio consistit in potentia sanctitatis, martyrii et laboris. Sed quare non est in multiplicatione in tempore, in quo sumus? Respondemus: Quia non habemus martyres, neque laborantes cum feruenti desiderio de sanctitate. Qualis est Dominus Deus noster? Sit 'qui est' (cf. Exod. 3,14)! Et quid mirum, si miracula modo non sunt, apostolorum tempore sicut erant". Texts from Exodus were favorite sources for crusade preachers because typological exegesis allowed them to link the crusades to the holy wars fought by the people of Israel to gain the Promised Land, thereby legitimating them.

⁷³ Ibid., pp. 254-5: "Incipite pro Deo, incipite. Nam mors uenit, et mille anni sunt iam praeteriti seu elapsi, in quibus melius negotium isto inceptum non fuit. Nam plangatis uerba atque pecuniae paucitatem, quam forte aliqui episcopi seu praelati ad Dei seruitium non expendunt. Et tamen plus, quam dictum sit, non constaret".

tion, rule, habit and insignia of this order is to incorporate characteristics of all the military orders to be joined into this new 'Order of Knights'.⁷⁴ In his discussion, Lull touches on aspects of the symbolic meaning of the cross. For example, his description of the cross which was to be placed on the military garb worn by the knights is evocative of the sacrificial suffering and death of Christ. He argues that it would be appropriate for the knights to wear this insignia because, "This first cross is the exemplar and *causa* of all other crosses".⁷⁵ Later Lull recommends that the red cross, representative of the first cross which was colored red by the blood of Christ, should be placed on a black background, a dark color reminiscent of the shadows which fell upon the earth at the time of Christ's death.⁷⁶ Additionally, Lull advises that the knights should "carry a great beard" to express their sorrow over the loss of the Holy Land and all other lands which the Christians once possessed until they are recovered.⁷⁷

Lull's discussion of insignia, colors and beards imaginatively incorporates observations about the symbolism of the cross that appear in crusade sermons such as James': the red color of the cross reminds us of the blood of Christ that was shed on the first cross; the color moves the heart and blood towards courage and valor. The arms of the cross remind us of the two natures of Christ as well as of divine, spiritual and corporal natures. "Such a cross in such a location, shape and color," Lull declares, "will lead to victory in battle by reason of its

⁷⁴ The logistics of such a consolidation would be daunting but not impossible, as Lull points out, if there is a will to accomplish it. Although Lull's plans have been charged with being utterly unrealistic, his attention to the idea that one measure will appease the Templars, and another, the Hospitallers, is evidence that he was actually sensitive to these realities. See *De fine*, p. 274: "Talis inquam crux cum tali loco, figura et colore in bello uictoriam obtinebit ratione similitudinis primae crucis; et de tali cruce fratres Templi se tenebunt pro contentis," and "Et sic per colorem panni erit satisfactum fratribus Hospitalis".

⁷⁵ *De fine*, p. 274: "Sed quantum ad crucem ista dico: Bonum est, ut de colore rubeo remaneat, ad significandum, quod prima crux fuit de Christi sanguine colorata; et etiam, quia color rubeus mouet cor et sanguinem ad audaciam et ualorem. Et talis crux fuit in cruce Domini figurate. Quae prima crux est exemplar et causa crucum omnium aliarum".

⁷⁶ *Ibid.*, p. 274: "Legitur in euangelio benedicto (Matt. 27, 45), quod in hora quando fuit mortuus Dominus noster Iesus Christus, tenebrae factae sunt super terram. Et quia tenebrae significant nigredinem siue umbram, cruce prima existente rubea per sanguinem, fuit in nigro colore uel obscure quantum ad aerem situate. Et sic figuratum fuit, quod crux fubea ordinis bellatoris sit in panno nigri chlamydis situate...Et etiam quod de colore chlamydis sint alia uestimenta, ad significandum, quod in campo nigro fuit positum corpus Christi. Etiam est in illis, qui de nigro se induunt, figuratum, quando aliquis est mortuus de eorum parentela".

⁷⁷ *Ibid.*, pp. 274-5: "Et quia deferunt propter tristitiam magnam barbam, fratres de ordine bellatoris portant similiter magnam barbam, ut figuratum sit, quod rex una cum suis militibus sunt in tristitia et dolore, et erunt, quousque Terra sancta, etiam terrae aliae, recuperatae sint, quas olim christianissimi possidebant".

similitude to the first cross".⁷⁸ The cross creates a parallel between Christ's victory over death and the military victories of the crusading knights and brings us back again full circle to the moral behavior demanded of the penitent. According to both authors, victories will be won if those participating in the campaign assume the appropriate penitential demeanor. This penitential context is evoked by Lull's allusions to the darkness and shadows at the time of Christ's death, the dark place in which the body of Christ was placed, and the sadness and sorrow felt by Christ's followers over the loss of the Holy Land and other places.⁷⁹ Lull asserts that both humility and victory were prefigured by the first cross and in that short phrase decisively ties the humility of penance to the individual victory (salvation) and the communal victory (recovery of the Holy Land) discussed above.⁸⁰ He has taken a standard element of crusade sermons and imaginatively incorporated them into the unique proposal he offers in *De fine*.

7. James of Vitry's *First Sermon to Crusaders* and *De fine*: The power of the cross and the increase of the Church

James of Vitry's sermon collections also include two sermon models addressed to "those who are or who will become crusaders".⁸¹ The contents of these sermons reinforces James' interest in the three basic issues described above, namely the connection between penitence and crusading as a particular type of pilgrimage, the connection between moral behavior and individual and communal victory, and an urgency derived from references to the passage of time and the Last Judgment and the call for a grateful response to the gift of salvation. Although the image of the wandering penitent is not found in these sermons, James does frequently use the cross to symbolize his ideas about crusading as he did in the sermon to pilgrims. These two sermons do, however, intro-

⁷⁸ See above, note 43.

⁷⁹ See above, note 45.

⁸⁰ *De fine*, p. 275: "In prima cruce fuit nobis humilitas et uictoria figurate. Cum igitur cum unanimitate hominum plurium uictoria fiat una, et ipsa humilitas significet communitatem plurium cum eodem intellectu; et quia Christus in mensae medio cum suis apostolic discumbibat, quod medium ipsius mensae locus est plus communis, mensa domini bellatoris communis omnibus debet esse, tamen modo debito ordinate, et quod dominus bellator rex in medio sedeat cum praedictis". In this passage, Lull moves from the idea of individual penitential humility to that of communal sense of humility when he makes an analogy between Christ at the table with his apostles to the *bellator rex* in the community of his knights.

⁸¹ These are edited and translated in Maier, *Crusade Ideology*, pp. 82-127. The sermons will be referred to as Sermon to crusaders I and II.

duce several new aspects of crusade theology that we can see incorporated into Lull's ideas about the crusade.

The first of these is a connection between the crusade and the increase of the church. This will be accomplished in part by the recovery of the Holy Land which is the reason James (and other preachers) are called to preach "forcefully and diligently".⁸² However, James goes on to identify the preacher's task as being to "labour and preach to convert souls and enlarge the church until...her salvation is lit like a lamp in the hearts of the listeners".⁸³ The link between crusade preaching and conversion is clear; however, context tells us that the conversion to which James is referring is that of the hearts of Christians. On the other hand, Lull extends this link to the conversion of unbelievers to the Christian faith, as can be seen by the coupling of mission and crusade in *De fine*. He is explicit about this:

And this distinction [on preaching] signifies the spiritual sword, namely truth against falsehood, ignorance and error. Now it follows concerning the second sword, namely the corporal [sword]. And since man is not composed of anything besides body and soul, these two swords are enough.⁸⁴

In the first of the sermons addressed to crusaders, James writes extensively about the sign of the cross, pointing out that it is used to distinguish God's people from the unfaithful and the reprobate. The cross serves as a kind of defense. Christ was also signed with the cross so that he could precede all others with the banners. Lull makes a similar point when describing the symbolism of the cross to be worn by the members of his military order.⁸⁵ James explains that since Christ was signed with the cross, the cross points towards his holy sepulcher. The sepulcher then appropriates the meaning of the cross. James explains that this means that many Christians, "after they have taken the sign of the salutary cross

⁸² Sermon to crusaders I, pp. 82-85: "Hiis verbis ostendi Ysa. Quam instanter et diligenter verbum Dei vobis debeamus predicare et maxime quando predicamus *propter Syon et Ierusalem*, ut scilicet Terra Sancta de minibus inimicorum liberetur".

⁸³ *Ibid.*, p. 84: "Vel *propter Syon non tacebo*, sed loquar id est propter ecclesiam...laborando scilicet et predicando propter animas convertendas et multiplicandum ecclesiam, *donec egrediatur ut splendor iustus eius*, id est cognoscatur per predicationem meam, et *salvator eius ut lampas accendatur* in cordis auditorium".

⁸⁴ *De fine*, p. 269: "Et ista distinctio gladium spiritualem significat, uidelicet ueritatem contra falsitatem, ignorantiam et errorem. Modo sequitur de secundo gladio, uidelicet corporali. Et quia homo non est compositus, nisi ex corpore et anima, gladii sufficient isti duo".

⁸⁵ Sermon to crusaders I, pp. 86-89: "Quod Christus cruce signatus fuit et de sepulcro Domini. Patet igitur quod signum Dei vivi habet Christus, ut signet milites suos; qui etiam prior cruce signari voluit, ut alios precederet cum vexillo crucis". For Lull, see above at note 70.

out of the love of Christ and out of devotion, exert themselves on land and at sea, so that they may see and honour [the sepulcher] in person.⁸⁶ This sermon contains extensive reflections about the desolation of Jerusalem, which are used to castigate those who are tepid and held back from participating in crusading because of worldly concerns.⁸⁷ Lull adpats this argument to his own purposes in *De fine* when he insists that all that is needed to bring his plans to fruition is the will. He claims that those who do not back his plans are lured away from their duty by worldly concerns.⁸⁸ A unique emphasis in James' sermon, in connection with the issue of the desolation of the Holy Land, is that "those who do not feel the wound of the head cannot be called true limbs of Christ".⁸⁹ James's descriptions of this desolation are vivid, drawing extensively on Old Testament imagery. They are echoed in Lull's comparison of the altar of St. Peter with that of Jerusalem.⁹⁰ James also draws on Old Testament texts to argue that there is no excuse for anyone to wait to profess a crusade vow to aid the Holy Land. He explains that the Lord wants to test his followers with the business of the Holy Land; God will recognize his friends by their willingness to suffer on his behalf. He invokes the maxim that "you cannot tell a friend in good times but in adversity you cannot lose sight of an enemy".⁹¹ A distinctive characteristic of this sermon model is its use of feudal analogy: "You hold your body and soul and all that you have from the highest emperor, who has you summoned today to come to his aid in battle, even if you are not bound by feudal law".⁹² Lull does not incorporate this type of analogy into *De fine*, probably because he was more attuned to urban society and sensibilities and was addressing a different audience.⁹³

⁸⁶ Ibid., p. 88: "[...] et sepulcrum, in quo iacuit, gloriosum est quia ab omnibus Christi fidelibus habetur in honore in tantum quod multi pro amore Christi et devotione assumpto salutifere crucis signaculo per terram et mare laborant, ut ipsum corporaliter videre valeant et honorare".

⁸⁷ For example, *ibid.*, p. 92: "Quid igitur de illis qui audiunt Terram Sanctam ab inimicis Christi conculcari et nec dolore moventur nec curare videntur".

⁸⁸ *De fine*, p. 289, text in note 43 above.

⁸⁹ Sermon to crusaders I, p. 90: "Unde vera Christi membra dici nequeunt qui capitis lesionem non sentient".

⁹⁰ *Ibid.*, p. 94; for Lull, see below, note 57.

⁹¹ Sermon to crusaders I, p. 96: "Quod Dominus occasione Terre Sancte vult probare suos et de indulgentia et merito signatorum. Posuit autem Dominus sicut Zach. [xii, 3] ait, *Ierusalem lapidem oneris cunctis gentibus*, ut scilicet probet qui sint amici eius et qui doleant vices ipsius; teste enim Ecc[us], [xii .8]: *Non agnoscitur in bonis amicus*, id est in prosperis non facile cognoscitur, *et non abscondetur in malis inimicus*".

⁹² *Ibid.*, p. 98: "Vos autem corpus et animam et quicquid habetis a summo imperatore tenetis, qui vos hodie citari facit, ut ei in prelio succuratis, et licet iure feodi non teneremini. Tanta et talia stipendia offert vobis quod sponte currere deberetis, remissionem cunctorum scilicet peccatorum quantum ad penam et culpam et insuper vitam eternam".

⁹³ That the crusade preachers adapted their message to different audiences is made clear by the options and variations offered for sermons by means of the sermon models.

8. James of Vitry's *Second Sermon to Crusaders and De fine: The power of the cross and the imitation of Christ*

James's second sermon model addressed to crusaders contains some interesting words about preachers and their task. He writes: "By his word and example a preacher must lead sinners away from a bad way of life as the adder [is led] from its cave".⁹⁴ Such an idea would have resonated strongly with Lull and recalls the relationship between preaching, conversion or penitence, and crusading that we have already explored in the sermon to pilgrims and in *De fine*. In this same part of the sermon James declares, "People believe a messenger who is educated, that is who has knowledge of the scriptures, and has a seal, that is the impression of a saintly way of life, with which he can instruct others".⁹⁵ The identity which Lull created for his post-conversion self fits this description and the autobiographical references sprinkled throughout his works, including *De fine*, show that this was intentional. Moreover, the portrait of Lull drawn figuratively in the *Vita coetanea* and literally in the *Breviculum* proves that James' observation still held true more than seventy-five years later.

In this sermon too, James draws extensively on the symbolism of the cross. An interesting emphasis is that the cross is meant to draw together people from all four corners of the earth; its message is applicable to all inhabitants of the world.⁹⁶ This universalism is comparable to Lull's plans as laid out in *De fine* and his main goal of bringing the whole world together to love, serve and honor God. Although James may have meant this in a metaphorical way, Lull certainly meant it much more literally.

This sermon also contains an interesting analogy between crusaders and officers of the highest king which sacralizes the crusader and his office:

Crusaders are not only key-bearers but treasurers and chancellors of Christ, holding the key to the heavenly treasure and the seal with which the flesh of Christ was stamped. As the house of God is recognized by the cross on top of it, so a man of the house of God is recognized by the cross put on his shoulders.⁹⁷

⁹⁴ Sermon to crusaders II, p. 100: "Hiis verbis ostendit Ysa. [xlili, 8] officium predicatoris et virtutem predicationis. Predicator quidem verbo et exemplo debet educere peccatores de conversatione mala velut aspidem de caverna [...]".

⁹⁵ Ibid., pp. 100-102: "Illi quidem nuntio creditor qui litteras habet, id est scientiam scripturarum, et sigillum, id est impressionem conversationis sancte, per quam valeat alios informare".

⁹⁶ Ibid., p. 104: "Levabit signum crucis ut profugi a Deo et per diversa vitia disperse ad hoc signum revertantur et a quatuor plagis terre, id est ab universe mundo, ad crucis vexillum populi congregentur".

⁹⁷ Ibid., p. 106: "Non solum autem clavigeri sed thesaurarii Christi et cancellarii sunt cruce signati, habentes clavem celestis thesauri et sigillum cui impressa fuit caro Christi. Sicut autem domus Dei cognoscitur per crucem superpositam, sic homo dignoscitur domus Dei per crucem humeris suis affixam".

Llull's description of the type of men who should be part of the unified military order, whose vocation was crusading, shows that he too thought that knights participating in crusading were engaged in sacred work and professed a sacred vocation, provided that they were morally upright.

This sermon contains an extended meditation on the power the cross. James advises his listeners that "...you too cannot cross the sea of this world and reach the heavenly Jerusalem without the cross".⁹⁸ In a reference to salvation history James writes, "It [the cross] is the power which the Lord gave to the world in its old age, by which it could be supported so it would not fall".⁹⁹ The cross is also the pillar on which we can hang our burdens; it gives us shade or a screen against the vices; it distinguishes us and consecrates us to the Lord; it is the ultimate remedy. James finishes with an exhortation:

So put yourself into the balance of the cross by taking the cross, and the Lord, who is weighing, will raise you up to the glory of the resurrection. It is the last plank for a shipwrecked world, the wood of life, the scales of justice, the king's scepter, the diadem of kings, the imperial throne, the shading tree, the staff of punishment, the supporting stick, the banner made red by the blood of Christ, by the sight of which we are encouraged to fight.¹⁰⁰

Any crusade preacher could find in this list an analogy around which to organize a sermon. However, with this list, James is arguing that the cross represents everything that has meaning. Llull's life and works testify to the endurance of that idea in later medieval spirituality.

Finally, among the elements of this sermon that would have appealed to Llull is a discussion of the glory (via indulgences) that comes to those who accept the sign of the cross. First, James states that those who take the cross, who have truly confessed and who have a contrite heart are considered martyrs while they are in the service of Christ. Second, he explains that there are other ways to earn the indulgence and help the crusading effort besides being an actual soldier of God.¹⁰¹ Llull would have agreed with the connection made between penitence

⁹⁸ *Ibid.*, p. 106: "[...] ita et vos sine cruce mare huius seculi non potestatis transire nec ad supernam Ierusalem pervenire".

⁹⁹ *Ibid.*, p. 106: "Hec est potentia quam dedit Dominus mundo in senectute sua, qua sustentaretur ne caderet".

¹⁰⁰ *Ibid.*, p. 108: "Pone igitur te crucem assumendo in statera crucis, et Dominus preponderans sublevarit te ad gloriam resurrectionis. Hec est suprema tabula mundo naufraganti, vite lignum, iustitie libra, sceptrum regni, regum diadema, thronus imperialis, arbor obumbrationis, vexillum Christi sanguine rubricatum, quo viso ad prelium incitatur".

¹⁰¹ *Ibid.*, pp. 112-113.

and service and approved of the desire to suffer death for Christ. He also clearly believed that there was a wide range of ways in which the “business” of the cross could be advanced. The three *distinctiones* of *De fine* are evidence of this. In the greater scheme of things, for both James and Lull, the work done for Christ, that is supporting the crusading effort, is modest labor in return for an immense reward. In fact, although God could easily liberate his land by himself with one word, he doesn’t do this because he wants to give his followers an opportunity to save their souls.¹⁰² We return here to the notion with which we began—that conversion requires action. To a certain extent, according to both James and Lull, it is the effort that counts even more than the outcome. Related to this is the idea, expressed by James in the sermon to pilgrims, that there are many benefits that accrue to the community merely through the crusade preaching itself. For if people attend sermons, they are not busy committing the sins they would otherwise commit; the sermon will make them remorseful and they will confess; people can earn indulgences just for attending the sermons; and finally, many will be encouraged to participate when they see others “rushing to the good bargain”.¹⁰³ While Lull did not incorporate these specific ideas into his treatise, he certainly would have agreed with the idea that the *negotium Dei* contributed to the common good and that preaching in general was beneficial in that it directed sinners towards confession and penitence.

9. Conclusions

Comparison of James of Vitry’s sermon models with *De fine* emphasizes the continuity of the basic elements of crusade ideology and imagery throughout the thirteenth century and into the fourteenth. However creatively Lull incorporated these standard concepts into his treatises on crusade, it is likely that he did so because they still resonated with a wide range of audiences. This supposition is borne out by the fact that later mendicant preachers of the crusade such as Humbert of Romans and Gilbert of Tournai also drew upon James’ sermon models for inspiration. These later preachers develop the imagery of the cross and focus on penance in ways that reflect particularly mendicant sensibilities; especially

¹⁰² Ibid., p. 116: “Hoc autem diligenter debetis attendere quod, cum Deus terram suam uno verbo per se posset liberare, ipse tamen servos suos honorare vult et socios habere in eius liberatione, dans vobis occasionem salvandi animas vestras, quas redemit et pro quibus sanguinem suum fudit...unde non eas libenter perdit”.

¹⁰³ Ibid., pp. 118-121, and at p. 120: “Tertium bonum quod multi incitantur ad idem faciendum dum alios currere vident ad bonum forum [...]”.

significant is the shift from emphasis on the apostolic life in general to the ideal of the *imitatio Christi* in particular. Gilbert of Tournai even uses the imagery of the stigmata as a rhetorical device.¹⁰⁴ Both of these authors also promote crusading against a backdrop of calls for reform of the Church. Although Humbert and Lull did not see eye to eye about the possibilities of converting the Muslims (Humbert dismisses the conversion of Muslims in favour of war and conquest), Lull's crusade treatises share many of the characteristics of the sermon models composed by both mendicants.¹⁰⁵

Although it would be untenable to argue for a direct influence between the crusade sermon models explored in this essay and Lull's *De fine*, their many common elements reveal a significant shared culture of penitential spirituality. This shared religious culture is not located as much in the detailed arguments of the sermons or of Lull's treatise, as it is in the religious convictions which provided the foundation upon which the arguments were made. Chief amongst these convictions is the recognition that private and individual—interior—religious experience demands some a public and communal—external—response. Lull's theological understanding of the working of the Trinity draws on just this kind of understanding. The tension that is discernable between the active and the contemplative life in some of Lull's works is somewhat resolved through his own hybridized, mendicant-like vocation. The movement from individual, personal appeals to take up the cross, to the public benefit (the *bonum publicum*) of that action, occurs along the axis of penitential conversion that pervades both the model sermons and *De fine*. It also mirrors an intensely corporate view of society as the body of Christ. Conversion may well take place interiorly but its effects are worked out in community. Thus, participating in a crusade campaign or preaching to unbelievers could be considered two sides of the same coin. The emphasis of the crusade sermons and Lull's texts was on the participation, the doing; the most significant results lay in an eschatological future. Preaching served as the bridge, bringing together the individual and the communal. Which brings us back, full circle, to the miniatures depicting Lull's conversion with which we started.

The "pre-conversion" Lull would have been just the type of person that crusade preachers would have been trying to reach. It is not unreasonable to sup-

¹⁰⁴ Gilbert of Tournai, Sermon One, in Maier, *Crusade Ideology*, pp. 176-8. On the development of the *imitatio Christi* ideal See G. Constable, *Three Studies in Medieval Religious and Social Thought* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1995), pp. 143-248.

¹⁰⁵ See Humbert of Romans, *Opusculum Tripartitum*, in Bird *et al.*, *Crusade and Christendom*, pp. 457-8.

pose that Lull would have been present in the audience of a crusade preacher at some point in his life. The common elements between the crusade sermon models and *De fine* indicate something more than a vague or generalized shared religious culture. Instead, they argue for closer ties—whether through sermons that were actually preached or through study of homiletic materials in medieval convents and universities. The miniatures, with their exploration of the process of conversion, its penitential significance, and its emphasis on acting or responding in a public way, through some kind of embodiment of religious virtue, more than hint at the nature of those ties. Comparison of *De fine* to James of Vitry's crusade sermon models does more than clarify the nature of Lull's crusade ideology. It also contributes some answers to the questions about the audience and reception of crusade preaching. The affinities between the crusade sermon models and *De fine* testify to the persistent connection between the theological ideas of penance and crusade ideology at least up to the early fourteenth century; in this light, Lull's writings on crusading can be read as representative of how thoroughly the theological ideas of penance and reforming spirituality had been integrated into the crusading ideology of his time. The conclusions drawn from this comparison also help to explain why Lull was able to promote crusading as consistent with his broader intellectual and spiritual goals. Ultimately, it is apparent that Lull's own theories of crusade conform to the ideals associated with 'conversion to penitence' represented in the miniature described above, ideals which are foundational and essential for the continued appeal of crusading into the later middle ages.

Key Words:

Lull's, *De fine*, James of Vitry, crusade, preaching, penance

Paraules clau:

Lull's, *De fine*, Jacques de Vitry, croades, predicació, penitència

Abstract

This essay compares James of Vitry's crusade sermon models with Lull's most extensive treatise on crusading, *De fine* and shows that the aspects of crusade ideology which they share are rooted in the penitential theology which developed throughout the course of the thirteenth century. The comparison has

implications for the role of preaching and homiletic materials in Llull's own intellectual and religious formation and for the centrality of preaching and rhetorical concerns in his thought. The study also contributes to our understanding of the persistence of enthusiasm for the crusade into the later middle ages and leads to a greater appreciation of the role that preaching played in that persistence. Most importantly, it points to Llull as representative of a crucial development in later medieval religious culture that came increasingly to emphasize the notion that religion was something that one *practiced*, not simply a set of propositions to be believed.

Resum

Aquest assaig compara els sermons-model de Jacques de Vitry sobre la croada amb el tractat més extens de Llull sobre aquesta matèria, el *De fine*, i mostra que els aspectes sobre la ideologia de croada que comparteixen deriven de la teologia penitencial que es va desenvolupar durant el segle XIII. La comparació té implicacions en el paper de la predicació i dels materials homilètics en la formació intel·lectual i religiosa de Llull, i en la centralitat que tenen la predicació i els procediments retòrics en el seu pensament. L'estudi també ajuda a comprendre la persistència de l'entusiasme per la croada a l'edat mitjana tardana i ensenya que la predicació va tenir un paper destacat en aquesta persistència. I, encara més rellevant, mostra que Llull s'inscriu en un desenvolupament crucial de la cultura religiosa medieval tardana, segons el qual cal identificar la religió amb una *pràctica vital* i no tan sols amb un repertori de proposicions en què cal creure.